

Jackson, L. and Nesterova, Y. (2017) Multicultural Hong Kong: alternative new media representations of ethnic minorities. *Multicultural Education Review*, 9(2), pp. 93-104. (doi: [10.1080/2005615X.2017.1313021](https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615X.2017.1313021)).

This is the author's final accepted version.

There may be differences between this version and the published version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from it.

<http://eprints.gla.ac.uk/216311/>

Deposited on: 26 May 2020

Enlighten – Research publications by members of the University of Glasgow
<http://eprints.gla.ac.uk>

Multicultural Hong Kong: alternative new media representations of ethnic minorities

Liz Jackson and Yulia Nesterova

University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong
lizjackson@hku.hk

Racial and ethnic minorities experience misrecognition, prejudice, and discrimination in Hong Kong. In response to these challenges, multicultural education there aims to enable young people to recognize diversity in a more tolerant, open-minded way. Educators have been encouraged to not rely only on textbooks, but to include news and digital media in such teaching. This paper examines online media representations of diversity in Hong Kong in the context of multicultural education, focusing on Apple Daily (AD), a popular liberal Hong Kong news source. We analyze how AD represents ethnic minorities, contributing to the construction of a particular multicultural environment and identity among Hong Kong people. Despite its multicultural orientation, AD remains problematic as a learning tool. In relation we recommend that more alternative digital media be used to learn about diversity in Hong Kong. We give as an example the use of student self-authored digital texts during the Hong Kong Umbrella Movement, which enabled ethnic minorities to engage in performative citizenship. We identify a focus on multiple, self-authored perspectives as part of critical media literacy, which we regard as essential for young people to better understand diversity, in contrast to straightforward reliance on multicultural news sources.

Keywords: Hong Kong, ethnic minorities, media, multicultural representation

Introduction

Despite the long term presence in Hong Kong (typically spanning generations) and cultural and other contributions, ethnic minorities' experiences and identities are not well understood in mainstream society. As Kapai (2015) notes, they are typically cast in government and media discourse as transient populations, while their needs for equal education and access to civic participation in society are neglected (see Baig & O'Connor, 2015). At the same time, Hong Kong's mainstream population struggles with racial and ethnic prejudice that signals structural discrimination and disadvantage. In a recent survey, over one-third of participants expressed they

would not want ethnic minorities in their neighborhoods, while over half indicated they did not want ethnic minorities in their personal lives (Unison, 2012). These findings suggest that race-based discourse is normalized in Hong Kong, to the detriment of those coming from unprivileged racial and ethnic groups (such as black and South Asian people).

In response to such challenges, there has been a rise in recent years in multicultural education in Hong Kong, to enable young people to recognize diversity in a more tolerant, open-minded way. The most substantive move in this direction was the 2009 curriculum reform, Liberal Studies. This curriculum includes as learning aims to help students 'appreciate and respect diversity in cultures and views in a pluralistic society,' and 'demonstrate an appreciation for the values of their own and other cultures, and for universal values, and be committed to becoming responsible and conscientious citizens' (CDC, 2007/2014, p. 5-6). Educators are encouraged in the subject to not rely on textbooks but to include new and digital media in teaching and learning, and focus on topics relevant to students' lives.

The role of the media in Hong Kong is undoubtedly powerful, as it spreads information about and relates particular images of ethnic minorities. It can thus be seen as a major venue for Hong Kongers to learn about multicultural diversity outside and inside schools, as there are not always sustainable contacts between communities. However, without critical media literacy skills, Liberal Studies educators may not be able to use such materials effectively to help students appreciate diversity in alignment with the curriculum's aims. Students will not

necessarily access balanced and accurate representations themselves, given the diversity and various orientations of locally consumed media outlets.

In this paper, we examine and juxtapose online media representations of diversity in Hong Kong and consider their implications for multicultural education. We rely first on *Apple Daily (AD)*, a popular and influential Hong Kong news source with liberal and pro-democracy inclinations (Hamlett, 2016; Yeung, 2014). *AD* is read by large numbers of pro-democracy youth in Hong Kong, who consider themselves liberal, cosmopolitan, and progressive, valuing multiculturalism, justice, and freedom. Despite its pro-multicultural orientation, we demonstrate how this source remains problematic as a learning tool. We argue in relation that more alternative digital media should be used to learn about diversity in Hong Kong. We give as an example here the use of student self-authored digital texts during the Hong Kong Umbrella Movement, which enabled ethnic minorities to engage in performative citizenship, staking a claim to Hong Kong in their own voices. We identify a focus on multiple, self-authored perspectives as part of critical media literacy, which we regard as essential for young people to better understand diversity, in contrast to straightforward reliance on multicultural news sources.

Ethnic minorities in Hong Kong

The Hong Kong population is comprised of roughly 94 percent residents of Chinese ethnicity, and six percent ethnic minorities, a number which has risen by 30 percent since 2004 (Kapai, 2015). Ethnic minorities come mostly from Southeast Asia (the Philippines, Indonesia, Thailand, Malaysia) and South Asia (India, Nepal, Pakistan)

(Hong Kong Yearbook, 2015). Of those born and settled in Hong Kong, the largest non-Chinese populations are Nepalese, Pakistanis, and Indians; these groups make up the majority of ethnic minority permanent residents (Census and Statistics Department, 2011). A more recent large migrant group of ethnic minorities come from Southeast Asia (especially the Philippines and Indonesia) and are represented mainly by female domestic workers (FDWs) (Arat et al., 2016).

Some challenges various ethnic minority groups face are similar, while some differ. For ethnic minorities who were born and/or have resided in Hong Kong for a long time and have families in the city, education is a major area of concern. Ethnic minority students' school attendance rates are much lower than those of the dominant group (School Education Statistics Section, 2012). They complete secondary school at much lower rates, and are infrequently found within Hong Kong's university student population (Equal Opportunities Commission, 2011). Low Chinese proficiency is a key obstacle to academic advancement of ethnic minorities (Kapai, 2015; Loper, 2004). As Chee (2015) points out, structural inequalities also help account for poor participation. Most ethnic minorities are likely to be employed in 'elementary occupations' such as social and personal services (Census and Statistics Department, 2011).

Media

When members of different social groups infrequently interact with each other, it is through media and education that people learn about different cultures and groups. Teachers may use media articles to teach about diversity and multiculturalism (Author, 2014; 2016). The Curriculum Development Council in Hong Kong encourages this, and discourages the use of textbooks in Liberal Studies. Media thus is used as a platform to enable diverse groups to learn about each other, and can contribute to building a more tolerant society. Media shapes people's cultures, identities, and perceptions of reality (Hammer, 2007). Even if students do not learn directly from such media as information dissemination, consumption of media helps people make sense of the world and reflects normalized representations of that world. It helps people understand what are considered normal, popular, sanctioned social, political, and ideological conceptions; which topics are taboo; and what is acceptable to express and do with regard to diverse others (Author, 2014).

Past research has suggested that mainstream media in Hong Kong represents minorities through a biased and limited lens (Baig & O'Connor, 2015; Kapai, 2015). Representation tends to be infrequent, as the focus is on what interests and concerns the dominant group (Hammer, 2007), and it is often stereotypical, as normalized conceptions within the dominant group are taken for granted (Zhao & Postiglione, 2010). Analyzing how the leading liberal Hong Kong newspaper *South China Morning Post* (SCMP) represents Mainland Chinese communities, Flowerdew, Li, and Tran (2002) identified four strategies. The first is negative representation of the other and their social and cultural differences from the mainstream group. The SCMP frequently includes negative metaphors to discuss immigration from China,

such as 'flood', 'influx', and 'burden'; describes people from China as 'poor', 'unemployable', 'dirty', 'uneducated', unhygienic', 'ignorant', and uncivilised'; and as 'overstayers', 'claimants', and 'illegal immigrants'. Scare tactics is the second strategy. This includes predicting possible threats to the dominant group and their interests; to public order, political stability, and rule of law; and emphasizing a financial drain of immigrants on the city. Scapegoating by shifting the blame for issues from the government to migrants is also common. Scapegoating takes place when the minority is regarded as a burden on the welfare of the majority. Finally, de-legitimation entails representing Mainland Chinese as an illegitimate group linked with illegal activities, and magnifying the voices of people who oppose them. The outcome is that Chinese Hong Kongers become indifferent to the difficulties this Other experiences (Flowerdew, Li, & Tran, 2002).

[Author] (2016) found that in Hong Kong's two major Chinese-language newspapers, *Oriental Daily* and *Apple Daily*, about 20 articles per year for the last several years (2009-2015) focused on ethnic or religious diversity. In *SCMP*, Hong Kong's English-language newspaper, about twice as many articles were published on this theme. Most references were found to have a negative tone, discussing problems ethnic minorities face, particularly Southeast Asians and South Asians. Such representations, according to [Author], provide an overly general, stereotypical conception of minorities' experiences and views, casting them in simplified terms as if they are deficient, challenged, and/or problematic.

Multicultural education and liberal studies

Multicultural education is teaching and learning practices and/or policies that respond to diversity in society or the classroom. *Assimilationism* was a historical precursor. *It asked that minorities adopt cultural characteristics aligned with or representative of mainstream society (Feinberg, 1998).* In contrast, multicultural education emerged in the late-twentieth century in many societies as an education focused not only on cultural integration, but also on increasing positive perceptions of diversity. That cultural diversity should be approached with open-mindedness and a positive spirit, rather than skepticism, was forward by Taylor (1992). However, some label this approach ‘tacos and piñatas’ in the United States, or ‘saris, samosa, and steel bands,’ in Britain, as a common focus on cultural artifacts can risk reducing diverse identities to stereotypes among well-meaning but culturally naïve educators (Author, 2014). As Appiah observes (1994), few people want to be seen as deviant, or as a minority whose sense of self hinges on difference.

Multiculturalism has thus recently focused on intersectional identities of students within an *intercultural* approach (Author, 2014). According to an intercultural view, none should be defined by single identity factors, such as ethnicity, race, gender, or religion, and all people have unique identities across social categories. People may face challenges and opportunities based on their identities. However, students should learn in this context how identity is complex and dynamic, and how cultures and identities can and do change in society, rather than being taught stereotypes of broad ‘Asian’ or ‘African’ culture, for example. Such learning is in line with Hong Kong Liberal Studies’ goals, such as to help students ‘appreciate and respect diversity in cultures and views in a pluralistic society,’ as

recognizing diversity precludes reducing complex identities to black and white cultural contrasts.

When it comes to implementing multicultural education, not all educators are experts. Research in Hong Kong (Hue & Kennedy, 2014; Author, 2016; 2015; 2014), has shown that many schoolteachers feel ill-equipped to navigate diversity issues in the classroom, and may not have much, if any, relevant educational or academic training or experience. In this case, educators may be inclined to rely upon text resources and supplements such as news media, in dealing with current events and topics related to diversity in the classroom, although they and their students may lack skills needed to examine sources from a critical viewpoint (Author, 2014). Critical media literacy is thus vital for multicultural education, as media may not give balanced, accurate views that help orientate students to intercultural attitudes and understandings.

Method

In this article we analyse representations of ethnic minorities from the online Hong Kong news source *Apple Daily* (*AD*). *AD* is a popular news outlet with pro-democracy inclinations (Hamlett, 2016) that is influential among young people (Yeung, 2014). *AD* has approximately 36 million views daily, and around two million unique visitors in total. It positions itself as critical and edgy and attracts readers among young, proactive, pro-democracy residents of Hong Kong, who consider themselves liberal, cosmopolitan, and progressive people with beliefs in multiculturalism, justice, and freedom.

Between 2004-2015 85 articles were published in *AD* focusing at least in part on ethnic minorities in Hong Kong. These articles were translated from Chinese to English, and analysed using qualitative content analysis, with a focus on narrative. The aim was to see how *AD* represents ethnic minorities, contributing to the construction of a particular kind of multicultural environment and identity among mainstream people in Hong Kong. We paid particular attention to whose voices were represented, and whose were not, and in which cases whose voices were represented. We coded references in terms of their discussing positive, negative, or mixed issues in relation to ethnic minorities, and also considered how the issues were reflected upon and discussed from the point of view of an ethnic minority or mainstream Chinese Hong Konger.

Findings

AD reports regularly on the issues and challenges ethnic minorities face in Hong Kong. Numerous articles focus on such issues as the language barrier in accessing medical treatment, education, and the labour market; inability to engage certain religious practices due to lack of facilities; discrimination and bullying in schools; and poor treatment by the police. 19 out of 85 articles reflect a positive representation of ethnic minorities, and 15 out of those 19 pieces bring in ethnic minorities' voices to a certain degree. Fifty-nine articles provide a more or less neutral reporting but do not focus on the strengths or voices of ethnic minorities in dealing with challenging issues. Seven articles give negative representations, and four of these seven include voices of ethnic minorities. However, even when ethnic

minorities' voices and stories are represented, it is not always unproblematic, as what is provided is inevitably limited in scope and length, and presented in particular lights.

Out of the 85 stories retrieved, 19 exhibit the positive strengths of ethnic minorities. These stories are focused on their resilience and willingness to challenge discrimination and inequality. For instance, ethnic minorities 'act as a bridge between the police and ethnic minorities' (Lo, 2009), learn Chinese despite many challenges ('500 Nepalis,' 2008), and protest unfair government bills and policies ('1,200 Ethnic Minorities,' 2006). Other stories cover traditions of Pakistani people (Lui, 2013), successful business ventures (Chan, 2013; Lai & Siu, 2015), harmonious environments at community centres (Lee, 2010a), artistic initiatives ('Ethnic Minorities Photography,' 2014; 'Ethnic Minorities Sing,' 2014), academic success (Yuen, 2014), political engagement through voting ('Ethnic Minorities Vote,' 2014) and joining Occupy Central ('Poly U Students,' 2014), good everyday citizenship (Lo, 2013) and friendship with Chinese Cantonese speakers ('Ethnic Minorities Photography,' 2014).

In some cases, ethnic minority voices are given substantive space in articles. Examples include the story and views on democracy and Mainland China of an Indian self-made millionaire ('Indian Tycoon,' 2007); and the stories of Chinese-speaking half-Pakistani police officer Man Tik (Wong & Ho, 2011), and half-Pakistani professor Raees Baig (Lee, 2010). Other positive representations are of an Indian woman who is fluent in Cantonese and holds a Law honors degree through an exchange program at Oxford University ('Good in Everything,' 2012), and a Hong Kong-born Indian law professor speaking of human rights ('Unison Went,' 2013).

In positively toned articles, the focus is most often given to Hong Kong Chinese people helping ethnic minorities adjust to Hong Kong life. The names of these people are always given, and it is discussed at length how they help disadvantaged groups. Some examples include:

- (a) The fund established by *AD* to help ethnic minorities find employment and repair their living spaces ('Help Ethnic Minorities,' 2010).
- (b) Fermi Wong, Director of Unison, who is mentioned 38 times in 85 articles, discussing her position on sensitive matters, and challenges and cultures of ethnic minorities.
- (c) A 20-year old Hong Konger Christine who created cultural tours to ethnic minorities' areas for Hong Kongers (Wong, 2013). In covering the initiative, *AD* did not include any ethnic minorities' views.

In contrast, the names and voices of ethnic minorities, together with their nationalities, are more often given in articles that focus on negative issues. Such stories include unacceptable actions of police (Chan, 2013), difficulties finding employment even with good qualifications ('Good in Everything,' 2012), lack of recognition as Hong Kongers by the government (Yuen & Mak, 2012), or unfair treatment by locals ('I Have To,' 2014). These articles focus on people who could be successful, as they have good family backgrounds and are educated, but are 'the sacrifice under this education system' ('Good in Everything,' 2012).

Fifty-nine articles make a clear attempt to report in a balanced way on ethnic minorities. *AD* does not indicate any major judgement, positive or negative, on ethnic minorities, but emphasizes the role of the government in not addressing or

failing to adequately consider challenges they face. However, *AD* hardly ever includes the voices of ethnic minorities to express how they see such problems. For example, the Director of Unison expressed outrage with the proposal to implement national education with a focus on China and cited disrespect for ethnic minorities and their cultures ('Kwong Claimed,' 2012). Whether ethnic minorities see it disrespectful to focus on China in education was not addressed. Similarly, in discussing a program to address sexual harassment specifically targeted to ethnic minorities, their views and evaluation of the program were not provided. Two Hong Kong Chinese women, a director of an organization that helps women who experience violence and a professor, commented on the issue ('Organization Claims,' 2015).

At times, articles express an aggressive position towards government inaction and policies for ethnic minorities. Lo (2009) argues that the government 'has to grant ethnic minorities the same rights as others legally.' Lo describes Hong Kong as a 'master and slave country,' and emphasizes that more voices should be heard, to reveal discrimination against ethnic minorities (2009). Again, no ethnic minorities' comments in regard to concerns raised are given, while their experiences are used in a second-hand way to showcase wrongdoings by authorities.

Seven articles are openly negative about ethnic minorities, and although four articles present ethnic minorities' voices, they are used to reinforce the negativity expressed. One article presents ethnic minorities as ignorant of local laws as they kill cows during a holiday in violation of Hong Kong regulations ('Celebrating

Slaughter,' 2009). Others link them to gangsters and unsafe environments (a) and oppressive culture (b):

(a) An article on crime in an ethnic minority area ('Cannot Work,' 2012) reports efforts to interview people in this area who were either scared to speak, lowered their voice, or reinforced the view that ethnic minorities abuse alcohol. The article, whose title translates roughly as 'Using Barbarian to Control Barbarian: Police Force Get Ethnic Minorities to be Police,' mentions the area as 'complicated' and the security situation as 'worrying.' It argues that police need to train ethnic minorities to assist them in security and communicating with 'criminals.'

(b) Muslim women are represented as weak and passive. Chan expresses frustration that 'although they study in Hong Kong, they cannot study together with boys,' must give up their studies once married, and obey 'oppressive traditional culture' (2013). No Muslim woman in Hong Kong represents their views on the matter.

A few other references to cultural norms are provided:

(a) Discussing booklets for the police to understand ethnic minorities, a police officer explains the behavior of African people in a stereotypical manner, saying that 'Africans like talking in the streets, sometimes they will tap people, and sometimes they will speak loudly. People may misunderstand them to be fighting' ('New Booklets,' 2010). No 'Africans' are included to explain such cultural patterns of behaviour.

(b) In 'Ethnic Minorities in Tiu King Leng,' it is claimed that 'to uphold the legacy,' Pakistani children need to study the Quran everyday, but no explanation is given of the Quran and its legacy.

(c) On two occasions Islam is portrayed in a favorable light, although only brief explanations are given. One article details how a Pakistani boy found a wallet of money and gave it to the police. The boy was quoted saying that Islam teaches respect for others and their property (Lo, 2013). In 'A "Little Pakistan" in Kwai Chung,' Lui (2013) discusses a mobile mosque that gathers Pakistani children to pray, calling it 'a unique cultural characteristic in this public estate.' Liu explains the meaning of praying for Muslim life and links Pakistani New Year to similar traditions in Chinese culture.

(d) One article emphasizes how cultural knowledge can empower minorities in difficult circumstances. Chan (2013) talks about how ethnic minority women organized an enterprise to attain additional income using Henna. The article makes a simplified connection to Middle Eastern and South Asian cultures by describing Henna as a traditional artistic expression.

Only one article in our study explores the lack of understanding of ethnic minorities by dominant society members. Discussing racial discrimination Tsao (2008) states: 'in Hong Kong people discriminate against Indians, but how much do they actually know about Indian culture?' Tsao recommends to have more experts on India in Hong Kong and provide more resources about Indian culture in schools, as racial discrimination stems from ignorance that 'should be corrected in education

not legislation' (2008). *AD* does not include the voice of Indian in Hong Kong to discuss their perspective on the need for greater cross-cultural understanding.

Discussion: alternative possibilities?

Although *AD* acts generally as a pro-multicultural news source, discussing challenges and issues on behalf of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong and representing their voices, a number of problematic themes can be observed. First, voices of ethnic minorities are limited in scope and length. Their comments are very short, and in most cases their stories are briefly represented, rather than their views on policies, practices, or incidents that involve or impact them. The voices that are represented belong to either people with a higher socioeconomic status (the Indian 'tycoon' or academics), academically successful young people fluent in Cantonese, or those who are half-Chinese. One such example is the article about the half-Pakistani professor Raees Baig (Lee, 2010a). Her story of studying at an elite school, learning Chinese, and attaining a doctorate is briefly presented, and she is quoted regarding serving as an MC at an event, that 'she could do better.' Six short sentences are devoted to her, with no larger discussion of ethnic minority issues. Meanwhile, the article quotes Fermi Wong, a Chinese Hong Konger advocate for ethnic minorities, with two paragraphs (11 sentences) discussing her opinion on the government's actions to help ethnic minorities. While Baig is complimented on her abilities as an MC and her education is discussed, Wong's position on the government and the Education Bureau are extensively provided, such as that the Deputy Commissioner Chan's 'words [about ethnic minorities] were...insulting' (Lee, 2010a).

Second, stories of ethnic minorities are used to showcase how inadequate the government response often is, in the newspaper's view, to challenges ethnic minorities face in Hong Kong. At the same time, they are not included in the discussion of actions of the government or nongovernmental organizations that directly affect them. Third, ethnic minorities' cultures are represented in a stereotypical, surface way that does not allow the reader to understand and relate to them. Fourth, there are still articles that give a negative representation of ethnic minorities without including their voice to express their views or understanding of the issue. Fifth, there is still a focus on representing certain groups as victims of oppressive cultural practices that prevent them from progressing (the case of Muslim women). Finally, voices of ethnic minorities are showcased primarily as a tool of journalists (Hong Kong Chinese people) in relation to Hong Kong authorities.

In this context, private, profit-driven media may not be able to contribute to equity, given its focus on the views and interests of the dominant group and their perspective. In contrast, self-authored media can be a more democratic, critical, and multicultural space for minorities to represent their views and interests on their own terms. A study of the 2014 Umbrella Movement in Hong Kong by Walsh (2016) shows how ethnic minority youth, by getting involved in protests and using social media to share their own role in struggles for democracy and freedom, facilitated broader discussions on inclusion and diversity in Hong Kong. Walsh discusses how participation in and publication regarding social struggles changed ethnic minority protestors' vision and understanding of their society and the world. This experience

gave them a sense of strength and social acceptance, and enhanced their belief that social change is possible.

Walsh focuses particularly on Hong Kong Pakistani Ansah, who was part of a group of ethnic minority youth who participated in protests. Ansah and her friends shared videos taken by cellphones on Facebook and other social media. Though of poor quality, the videos started discussions about diversity online. Ansah shares her experience participating in the movement:

We knew it was a bit risky, because for us, the police can pick us up very easily. We are very easy targets, as ethnic minorities. All the Chinese out there, and only a few faces of us...But we had to take the risk, because we have to show we are also part of this community, and we support them as well. We want changes in Hong Kong, for our own future, for our families and for our upcoming generations, so we came out. (Walsh, 2016)

However, after she started marching with her banner she found other protestors commenting, 'We love you! You are also Hong Kong people.' As she expresses, 'even if nothing happens, or only a bit happens, I would say something has changed for us.' As Walsh observes such participation in society and its online documentation provides a powerful counter narrative to stereotyped representations that cast ethnic minorities in society as uncommitted, victims, or non-participatory.

Including such self-authored alternative platforms, teachers can better include the stories and perspectives of ethnic minorities, who pose controversial and provocative questions to the mainstream society. As in Walsh's study (2016), their stories more effectively invite discussions on racism, history, place, globalization, inclusion and exclusion, citizenship, and more. Using such material in

the classroom, teachers can help their students think critically about how multicultural the community is and what is needed for it to become more inclusive and safe. They can bring discussions into the classroom on how ethnic minorities can contribute to building an inclusive environment by getting involved in struggles for their own rights. Such learning can challenge students to think about how such social struggles indicate participation of citizens of a multicultural, multilingual, and democratic society, and serve to construct new knowledge and understanding about space and place, identities, and relationships among people of different ethnicities. Ultimately, as Walsh's study shows, young people's engagement with voices of people from other cultural and ethnic backgrounds can give them a stronger sense of their experiences of justice and injustice, of right and wrong, and can direct them to understand their own society and people in it, and work towards justice and inclusion so that no voices are misrepresented or excluded.

Conclusion

Ethnic minorities experience discrimination and prejudice in Hong Kong, and are often found in a poorer socioeconomic position. Cultural differences can lead to misunderstandings between dominant and minority groups and make it more challenging for ethnic minorities to adjust and for mainstream society to understand their experiences. To close cultural gaps, multicultural education in Hong Kong has been on the rise. To appreciate diversity and respect other cultures and views, Liberal Studies encourages teachers to use new digital media sources. Here we assessed one media source considered to be pro-multicultural and pro-democratic,

to see how diversity is represented. Our study shows that despite having a pro-multicultural orientation as compared to other news sources in Hong Kong, AD remains an insufficient learning tool for multicultural education. Its voices are mainly of the dominant group who represent ethnic minorities in a stereotypical, victimized fashion, and act on behalf of them. We conclude that more alternative, self-authored digital media should be used to help students in Hong Kong to more effectively learn about and relate to each other in society in multicultural education.

References

500 尼泊爾人巡遊望政府關注少數族裔教育[500 Nepali Joined the Parade and Hoped the Government Would Pay Attention to Ethnic Minorities' Education]. (2008, December 26). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

1,200 少數族裔上街爭平等 [1,200 Ethnic Minorities Fight for Equality]. (2006, December 18). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Appiah, K. A. (1994). Identity, authenticity, survival: Multicultural societies and social reproduction. In A. Gutmann (Ed.), *Multiculturalism: Examining the politics of recognition* (pp. 107-148). Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Arat, G., Hoang, A. P., Jordan, L. P., & Wong, P. W. C. (2016). A Systematic Review of Studies on Ethnic Minority Youth Development in Hong Kong: An Application of the Ecological Framework. *China Journal of Social Work*, 9(3). doi: 10.1080/17525098.2017.1254716.

Baig, R. B., & O'Connor, P. (2015). Hong Kong Muslim Representations in Cantonese Media: An Oriental Orientalism? *Asian Anthropology*, 14(1), 67-78. doi:10.1080/1683478X.2015.1025590

爽爆：無力上游 隨波入濁流 南亞裔古惑仔染黑南邊圍 [Cannot Work and Follow Suit: South Asians Gangsters in Nam Bin Wai]. (2012, October 15). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

歡度宰牲節 未領許可證 屠牛分肉回教徒被帶走 [Celebrating Slaughter Festival: The Beef Cutting Muslim Was Taken Away]. (2009, November 29). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Census and Statistics Department. (2012). *Thematic Report: Ethnic Minorities*. Hong Kong, SAR.

Chan, K. Y. (2013, December 9). 少數族裔開班教傳統藝術巴婦刺繡大獲好評 [Ethnic Minorities Open Classes for Traditional Arts: Pakistani Lady Praised]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Chee, W.-c. (2015). The Perceived Role of Religion in the Educational Attainment of Pakistani Immigrant Secondary Students in Hong Kong. *Asian Anthropology*, 14(1), 33-42. doi:10.1080/1683478X.2015.1025592

Curriculum Development Council. (2007/2014). *Liberal studies curriculum guidelines*. Hong Kong: Education Bureau.

Equal Opportunity Commission (EOC). (2011). *Education for all: Report on the Working Group on Education for Ethnic Minorities*. Hong Kong, SAR.

她眼中少數族裔故事 [Ethnic Minorities in Her Eyes]. (2013, December 9). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

少數族裔攝影展 推廣共融 [Ethnic Minorities Photography Show to Promote Inclusion]. (2014, January 20). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

【今日投票】少數族裔唱《問誰未發聲》 [Ethnic Minorities Sing ‘Do You Hear the People Sing’]. (2014, June 20). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

少數族裔投票：要憑良心做事 [Ethnic Minorities Vote: Based on Our Minds]. (2014, June 29). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Feinberg, W. (1998). *Common schools/uncommon identities: National unity and cultural difference*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Flowerdrew, J., Li, D. C. S., & Tran, S. (2002). Discriminatory News Discourse: Some Hong Kong Data. *Discourse & Society*, 13(3), 319–345.

樣樣頂呱呱 弊在中文差法律女精英在港求職碰壁 [Good in Everything but Not Chinese Legal Professional Has Difficulties Finding Jobs]. (2012, May 6). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Hamlett, T. (2016, October 2). Protesting Too Much? What the Public Will See in CY’s Legal Threat against Apple Daily. *Hong Kong Free Press*. Retrieved from <https://www.hongkongfp.com/2016/10/02/protesting-too-much-the-public-will-see-through-cys-6-page-legal-threat-against-apple-daily/>

Hammer, Y. (2007). Multiculturalism and the Mass Media. *Journal of Law and Ethics of Human Rights*, 1(169), 1-35.

助少數族裔改善家居 [Help Ethnic Minorities Clean Their Homes]. (2010, March 28). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Hong Kong Yearbook. (2015). *The Facts*. Retrieved from <http://www.yearbook.gov.hk/2015/en/pdf/Facts.pdf>

今日我發 SING ! 菲牧師：少數族裔無處發聲 [I Have to Voice out! Filipino Priest: Ethnic Minorities Have No Way to Voice out]. (2014, June 21). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

印裔富商心繫香港 回歸 10 年百人誌 夏利萊：普選應由市民決定 [Indian Tycoon's Heart With Hong Kong People a Decade of Handover, Harilela: Universal Suffrage Should be Decided by Citizens]. (2007, June 20). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Jackson, L. (2014). Muslims and Islam in US Education: Reconsidering Multiculturalism. London: Routledge.

Jackson, L. (2015). Religion in Hong Kong Education: Representation in Liberal Studies Textbooks. *Asian Anthropology*, 14(1), 43-56.

Jackson, L. (2017). Learning about Diversity in Hong Kong: Multiculturalism in Liberal Studies Textbooks. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 26(1), 21-29. (This is listed as 2016 in the text).

Kapai, P. (2015). *The status of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong, 1997 to 2014*. Hong Kong: Centre for Comparative and Public Law.

Kapai, P. (2015). *The status of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong, 1997 to 2014*. Hong Kong: Centre for Comparative and Public Law.

Lai, T. W. & Siu, P. L. (2015, January 25). 泰菜館助少數族裔就業 融入香港 幫襯社企 良心消費 [Thai Cuisine Helps Ethnic Minorities Join Hong Kong Society, Support Social Enterprise]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

林煥光稱國教沒種族歧視 [Lam Woon Kwong Claimed National Education Does Not Involve Discrimination]. (2012, September 14). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Lee, P. F. (2010, November 10). 隔牆有耳：林 D9 探少數族裔考廣東話 [Side Story: Lam Tests Ethnic Minorities During Visit]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

- Lee, P. F. (2010, December 20). 隔牆有耳：《城市論壇》中巴女主持迷倒網民 [Outside Story: MC of 'City Forum' Charms Netizens]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- Lo, F. (2009, April 29). 蘋論：種族問題不能再掉以輕心 [Ethnic Problems Cannot Be Ignored]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- Lo, K. Y. (2013, June 29). 【埋身擊】南亞仔執三萬元交阿 Sir 失主感動 稱對少數族裔改觀 [(Touching) South Asian Boy Gave 30,000 HKD Back to Police Feeling Touched and Perception Ethnic Minorities Changed]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- Loper, K. (2004). *Race and equality: A study of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong's education system* (Occasional Paper No. 12). Hong Kong: Centre for Comparative and Public Law.
- Lui, L. S. (2013, October 27). 蘋果側影：葵涌有個「小巴基斯坦」 [A 'Little Pakistan' in Kwai Chung]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- 尼裔青年欲投考警隊化解歧視 [Nepalese Youth Aspire to Join the Police Force to Solve Discrimination]. (2009, April 6). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- 油尖警區出書仔教前線人員應對新措施避免少數族裔誤會 [New Booklets Out for Frontline Police to Avoid Misunderstanding Ethnic Minorities]. (2010, February 22). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- 組織指性侵求助外傭少數族裔 [Organization Claims 10% of Sexual Harassment Faced By Ethnic Minorities]. (2015, March 7). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- 理大生不罷學 研習尼泊爾話 [Poly U Students Ignore Boycott and Learn Nepalese]. (2014, September 23). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- School Education Statistics Section. (2012). *Statistics on the non-Chinese Speaking Students (NCS) Population between 2006–2011*. Hong Kong: Education Bureau.
- Tsao, C. (2008, July 20). 星期天休息：反種族歧視條例是自埋的另一顆地雷 [Rest on Sunday: Anti-Racial Discrimination Bill Is Self-Made Bomb]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
- Unison Hong Kong. (2012). *Racial acceptance survey report*. Hong Kong: Unison.
- 融樂會赴聯合國申訴港不公 [Unison Went to UN for Injustice in Hong Kong]. (2013, March 9). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Walsh, S. (2016). Under the umbrella: Pedagogy, knowledge production and video from the margins of the movement. *Educational Philosophy and Theory* (in press).

Wong, S. K. (2013, November 11). 文化導賞團走入少數族裔社區 香港遊世界體現共融 [Cultural Tours Enter Ethnic Minorities Community]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Wong, H. Y. & Ho W. L. (2011, May 5). 近月元朗行咁處理少數族裔案件 回歸 14 年再見巴警出更 [Patrolling in Hong Kong to Tackle Ethnic Minorities Cases: Pakistani Police Appear After 14 Years]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Yuen, L. T. (2014, March 20). 馬會獎學金首頒少數族裔 [First Ethnic Minority Awarded Jockey Club Scholarship]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Yuen, L. T. & Mak C. W. (2012, December 13). 植根港百年 巴漢被拒入籍 入境處原因：沒有近親是中國人 [Pakistani Rejected For Chinese Immigration, Department Reason: He Has No Chinese Relatives]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Zhao, Z., & Postiglione, G. A. (2010). Representations of Ethnic Minorities in China's University Media. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 31(4), 1-18.

Multicultural Hong Kong: alternative new media representations of ethnic minorities

Liz Jackson and Yulia Nesterova

University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong
lizjackson@hku.hk

Racial and ethnic minorities experience misrecognition, prejudice, and discrimination in Hong Kong. In response to these challenges, multicultural education there aims to enable young people to recognize diversity in a more tolerant, open-minded way. Educators have been encouraged to not rely only on textbooks, but to include news and digital media in such teaching. This paper examines online media representations of diversity in Hong Kong in the context of multicultural education, focusing on Apple Daily (AD), a popular liberal Hong Kong news source. We analyze how AD represents ethnic minorities, contributing to the construction of a particular multicultural environment and identity among Hong Kong people. Despite its multicultural orientation, AD remains problematic as a learning tool. In relation we recommend that more alternative digital media be used to learn about diversity in Hong Kong. We give as an example the use of student self-authored digital texts during the Hong Kong Umbrella Movement, which enabled ethnic minorities to engage in performative citizenship. We identify a focus on multiple, self-authored perspectives as part of critical media literacy, which we regard as essential for young people to better understand diversity, in contrast to straightforward reliance on multicultural news sources.

Keywords: Hong Kong, ethnic minorities, media, multicultural representation

Introduction

Despite the long term presence in Hong Kong (typically spanning generations) and cultural and other contributions, ethnic minorities' experiences and identities are not well understood in mainstream society. As Kapai (2015) notes, they are typically cast in government and media discourse as transient populations, while their needs for equal education and access to civic participation in society are neglected (see Baig & O'Connor, 2015). At the same time, Hong Kong's mainstream population struggles with racial and ethnic prejudice that signals structural discrimination and disadvantage. In a recent survey, over one-third of participants expressed they

1
2
3
4 would not want ethnic minorities in their neighborhoods, while over half indicated
5
6 they did not want ethnic minorities in their personal lives (Unison, 2012). These
7
8 findings suggest that race-based discourse is normalized in Hong Kong, to the
9
10 detriment of those coming from unprivileged racial and ethnic groups (such as black
11
12 and South Asian people).
13
14

15
16 In response to such challenges, there has been a rise in recent years in
17
18 multicultural education in Hong Kong, to enable young people to recognize diversity
19
20 in a more tolerant, open-minded way. The most substantive move in this direction
21
22 was the 2009 curriculum reform, Liberal Studies. This curriculum includes as
23
24 learning aims to help students ‘appreciate and respect diversity in cultures and
25
26 views in a pluralistic society,’ and ‘demonstrate an appreciation for the values of
27
28 their own and other cultures, and for universal values, and be committed to
29
30 becoming responsible and conscientious citizens’ (CDC, 2007/2014, p. 5-6).
31
32 Educators are encouraged in the subject to not rely on textbooks but to include new
33
34 and digital media in teaching and learning, and focus on topics relevant to students’
35
36 lives.
37
38
39
40
41
42

43
44 The role of the media in Hong Kong is undoubtedly powerful, as it spreads
45
46 information about and relates particular images of ethnic minorities. It can thus be
47
48 seen as a major venue for Hong Kongers to learn about multicultural diversity
49
50 outside and inside schools, as there are not always sustainable contacts between
51
52 communities. However, without critical media literacy skills, Liberal Studies
53
54 educators may not be able to use such materials effectively to help students
55
56 appreciate diversity in alignment with the curriculum’s aims. Students will not
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

necessarily access balanced and accurate representations themselves, given the diversity and various orientations of locally consumed media outlets.

In this paper, we examine and juxtapose online media representations of diversity in Hong Kong and consider their implications for multicultural education. We rely first on *Apple Daily (AD)*, a popular and influential Hong Kong news source with liberal and pro-democracy inclinations (Hamlett, 2016; Yeung, 2014). *AD* is read by large numbers of pro-democracy youth in Hong Kong, who consider themselves liberal, cosmopolitan, and progressive, valuing multiculturalism, justice, and freedom. Despite its pro-multicultural orientation, we demonstrate how this source remains problematic as a learning tool. We argue in relation that more alternative digital media should be used to learn about diversity in Hong Kong. We give as an example here the use of student self-authored digital texts during the Hong Kong Umbrella Movement, which enabled ethnic minorities to engage in performative citizenship, staking a claim to Hong Kong in their own voices. We identify a focus on multiple, self-authored perspectives as part of critical media literacy, which we regard as essential for young people to better understand diversity, in contrast to straightforward reliance on multicultural news sources.

Ethnic minorities in Hong Kong

The Hong Kong population is comprised of roughly 94 percent residents of Chinese ethnicity, and six percent ethnic minorities, a number which has risen by 30 percent since 2004 (Kapai, 2015). Ethnic minorities come mostly from Southeast Asia (the Philippines, Indonesia, Thailand, Malaysia) and South Asia (India, Nepal, Pakistan)

(Hong Kong Yearbook, 2015). Of those born and settled in Hong Kong, the largest non-Chinese populations are Nepalese, Pakistanis, and Indians; these groups make up the majority of ethnic minority permanent residents (Census and Statistics Department, 2011). A more recent large migrant group of ethnic minorities come from Southeast Asia (especially the Philippines and Indonesia) and are represented mainly by female domestic workers (FDWs) (Arat et al., 2016).

Some challenges various ethnic minority groups face are similar, while some differ. For ethnic minorities who were born and/or have resided in Hong Kong for a long time and have families in the city, education is a major area of concern. Ethnic minority students' school attendance rates are much lower than those of the dominant group (School Education Statistics Section, 2012). They complete secondary school at much lower rates, and are infrequently found within Hong Kong's university student population (Equal Opportunities Commission, 2011). Low Chinese proficiency is a key obstacle to academic advancement of ethnic minorities (Kapai, 2015; Loper, 2004). As Chee (2015) points out, structural inequalities also help account for poor participation. Most ethnic minorities are likely to be employed in 'elementary occupations' such as social and personal services (Census and Statistics Department, 2011).

Media

1
2
3
4 When members of different social groups infrequently interact with each other, it is
5
6 through media and education that people learn about different cultures and groups.
7
8 Teachers may use media articles to teach about diversity and multiculturalism
9
10 (Author, 2014; 2016). The Curriculum Development Council in Hong Kong
11
12 encourages this, and discourages the use of textbooks in Liberal Studies. Media thus
13
14 is used as a platform to enable diverse groups to learn about each other, and can
15
16 contribute to building a more tolerant society. Media shapes people's cultures,
17
18 identities, and perceptions of reality (Hammer, 2007). Even if students do not learn
19
20 directly from such media as information dissemination, consumption of media helps
21
22 people make sense of the world and reflects normalized representations of that
23
24 world. It helps people understand what are considered normal, popular, sanctioned
25
26 social, political, and ideological conceptions; which topics are taboo; and what is
27
28 acceptable to express and do with regard to diverse others (Author, 2014).
29
30
31
32
33
34
35

36
37 Past research has suggested that mainstream media in Hong Kong represents
38
39 minorities through a biased and limited lens (Baig & O'Connor, 2015; Kapai, 2015).
40
41 Representation tends to be infrequent, as the focus is on what interests and
42
43 concerns the dominant group (Hammer, 2007), and it is often stereotypical, as
44
45 normalized conceptions within the dominant group are taken for granted (Zhao &
46
47 Postiglione, 2010). Analyzing how the leading liberal Hong Kong newspaper *South*
48
49 *China Morning Post* (SCMP) represents Mainland Chinese communities, Flowerdew,
50
51 Li, and Tran (2002) identified four strategies. The first is negative representation of
52
53 the other and their social and cultural differences from the mainstream group. The
54
55 SCMP frequently includes negative metaphors to discuss immigration from China,
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 such as 'flood', 'influx', and 'burden'; describes people from China as 'poor',
5
6 'unemployable', 'dirty', 'uneducated', unhygienic', 'ignorant', and uncivilised'; and as
7
8 'overstayers', 'claimants', and 'illegal immigrants'. Scare tactics is the second
9
10 strategy. This includes predicting possible threats to the dominant group and their
11
12 interests; to public order, political stability, and rule of law; and emphasizing a
13
14 financial drain of immigrants on the city. Scapegoating by shifting the blame for
15
16 issues from the government to migrants is also common. Scapegoating takes place
17
18 when the minority is regarded as a burden on the welfare of the majority. Finally,
19
20 de-legitimation entails representing Mainland Chinese as an illegitimate group
21
22 linked with illegal activities, and magnifying the voices of people who oppose them.
23
24 The outcome is that Chinese Hong Kongers become indifferent to the difficulties this
25
26 Other experiences (Flowerdew, Li, & Tran, 2002).

27
28
29 [Author] (2016) found that in Hong Kong's two major Chinese-language
30
31 newspapers, *Oriental Daily* and *Apple Daily*, about 20 articles per year for the last several
32
33 years (2009-2015) focused on ethnic or religious diversity. In *SCMP*, Hong Kong's
34
35 English-language newspaper, about twice as many articles were published on this theme.
36
37 Most references were found to have a negative tone, discussing problems ethnic
38
39 minorities face, particularly Southeast Asians and South Asians. Such representations,
40
41 according to [Author], provide an overly general, stereotypical conception of minorities'
42
43 experiences and views, casting them in simplified terms as if they are deficient,
44
45 challenged, and/or problematic.
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57

58 **Multicultural education and liberal studies**

59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 Multicultural education is teaching and learning practices and/or policies
5
6 that respond to diversity in society or the classroom. *Assimilationism* was a
7
8 historical precursor. *It asked that minorities adopt cultural characteristics aligned*
9
10 *with or representative of mainstream society (Feinberg, 1998).* In contrast,
11
12 multicultural education emerged in the late-twentieth century in many societies as
13
14 an education focused not only on cultural integration, but also on increasing positive
15
16 perceptions of diversity. That cultural diversity should be approached with open-
17
18 mindedness and a positive spirit, rather than skepticism, was forward by Taylor
19
20 (1992). However, some label this approach ‘tacos and piñatas’ in the United States,
21
22 or ‘saris, samosa, and steel bands,’ in Britain, as a common focus on cultural artifacts
23
24 can risk reducing diverse identities to stereotypes among well-meaning but
25
26 culturally naïve educators (Author, 2014). As Appiah observes (1994), few people
27
28 want to be seen as deviant, or as a minority whose sense of self hinges on difference.
29
30
31
32
33
34
35

36
37 Multiculturalism has thus recently focused on intersectional identities of
38
39 students within an *intercultural* approach (Author, 2014). According to an
40
41 intercultural view, none should be defined by single identity factors, such as
42
43 ethnicity, race, gender, or religion, and all people have unique identities across
44
45 social categories. People may face challenges and opportunities based on their
46
47 identities. However, students should learn in this context how identity is complex
48
49 and dynamic, and how cultures and identities can and do change in society, rather
50
51 than being taught stereotypes of broad ‘Asian’ or ‘African’ culture, for example. Such
52
53 learning is in line with Hong Kong Liberal Studies’ goals, such as to help students
54
55 ‘appreciate and respect diversity in cultures and views in a pluralistic society,’ as
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 recognizing diversity precludes reducing complex identities to black and white
5
6 cultural contrasts.
7

8
9 When it comes to implementing multicultural education, not all educators
10 are experts. Research in Hong Kong (Hue & Kennedy, 2014; Author, 2016; 2015;
11 2014), has shown that many schoolteachers feel ill-equipped to navigate diversity
12 issues in the classroom, and may not have much, if any, relevant educational or
13 academic training or experience. In this case, educators may be inclined to rely upon
14 text resources and supplements such as news media, in dealing with current events
15 and topics related to diversity in the classroom, although they and their students
16 may lack skills needed to examine sources from a critical viewpoint (Author, 2014).
17 Critical media literacy is thus vital for multicultural education, as media may not
18 give balanced, accurate views that help orientate students to intercultural attitudes
19 and understandings.
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38

39 **Method**

40
41 In this article we analyse representations of ethnic minorities from the online Hong
42 Kong news source *Apple Daily* (AD). AD is a popular news outlet with pro-democracy
43 inclinations (Hamlett, 2016) that is influential among young people (Yeung, 2014).
44 AD has approximately 36 million views daily, and around two million unique
45 visitors in total. It positions itself as critical and edgy and attracts readers among
46 young, proactive, pro-democracy residents of Hong Kong, who consider themselves
47 liberal, cosmopolitan, and progressive people with beliefs in multiculturalism,
48 justice, and freedom.
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

Between 2004-2015 85 articles were published in *AD* focusing at least in part on ethnic minorities in Hong Kong. These articles were translated from Chinese to English, and analysed using qualitative content analysis, with a focus on narrative. The aim was to see how *AD* represents ethnic minorities, contributing to the construction of a particular kind of multicultural environment and identity among mainstream people in Hong Kong. We paid particular attention to whose voices were represented, and whose were not, and in which cases whose voices were represented. We coded references in terms of their discussing positive, negative, or mixed issues in relation to ethnic minorities, and also considered how the issues were reflected upon and discussed from the point of view of an ethnic minority or mainstream Chinese Hong Konger.

Findings

AD reports regularly on the issues and challenges ethnic minorities face in Hong Kong. Numerous articles focus on such issues as the language barrier in accessing medical treatment, education, and the labour market; inability to engage certain religious practices due to lack of facilities; discrimination and bullying in schools; and poor treatment by the police. 19 out of 85 articles reflect a positive representation of ethnic minorities, and 15 out of those 19 pieces bring in ethnic minorities' voices to a certain degree. Fifty-nine articles provide a more or less neutral reporting but do not focus on the strengths or voices of ethnic minorities in dealing with challenging issues. Seven articles give negative representations, and four of these seven include voices of ethnic minorities. However, even when ethnic

1
2
3
4 minorities' voices and stories are represented, it is not always unproblematic, as
5
6
7 what is provided is inevitably limited in scope and length, and presented in
8
9 particular lights.

10
11 Out of the 85 stories retrieved, 19 exhibit the positive strengths of ethnic
12
13 minorities. These stories are focused on their resilience and willingness to challenge
14
15 discrimination and inequality. For instance, ethnic minorities 'act as a bridge
16
17 between the police and ethnic minorities' (Lo, 2009), learn Chinese despite many
18
19 challenges ('500 Nepalis,' 2008), and protest unfair government bills and policies
20
21 ('1,200 Ethnic Minorities,' 2006). Other stories cover traditions of Pakistani people (Lui,
22
23 2013), successful business ventures (Chan, 2013; Lai & Siu, 2015), harmonious
24
25 environments at community centres (Lee, 2010a), artistic initiatives ('Ethnic Minorities
26
27 Photography,' 2014; 'Ethnic Minorities Sing,' 2014), academic success (Yuen, 2014),
28
29 political engagement through voting ('Ethnic Minorities Vote,' 2014) and joining Occupy
30
31 Central ('Poly U Students,' 2014), good everyday citizenship (Lo, 2013) and friendship
32
33 with Chinese Cantonese speakers ('Ethnic Minorities Photography,' 2014).

34
35 In some cases, ethnic minority voices are given substantive space in articles.
36
37 Examples include the story and views on democracy and Mainland China of an
38
39 Indian self-made millionaire ('Indian Tycoon,' 2007); and the stories of Chinese-
40
41 speaking half-Pakistani police officer Man Tik (Wong & Ho, 2011), and half-Pakistani
42
43 professor Raees Baig (Lee, 2010). Other positive representations are of an Indian
44
45 woman who is fluent in Cantonese and holds a Law honors degree through an exchange
46
47 program at Oxford University ('Good in Everything,' 2012), and a Hong Kong-born
48
49 Indian law professor speaking of human rights ('Unison Went,' 2013).
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 In positively toned articles, the focus is most often given to Hong Kong
5
6 Chinese people helping ethnic minorities adjust to Hong Kong life. The names of
7
8 these people are always given, and it is discussed at length how they help
9
10 disadvantaged groups. Some examples include:
11
12
13

14
15 (a) The fund established by *AD* to help ethnic minorities find employment and
16
17 repair their living spaces ('Help Ethnic Minorities,' 2010).
18

19
20 (b) Fermi Wong, Director of Unison, who is mentioned 38 times in 85 articles,
21
22 discussing her position on sensitive matters, and challenges and cultures of
23
24 ethnic minorities.
25

26
27 (c) A 20-year old Hong Konger Christine who created cultural tours to ethnic
28
29 minorities' areas for Hong Kongers (Wong, 2013). In covering the initiative, *AD*
30
31 did not include any ethnic minorities' views.
32
33

34
35 In contrast, the names and voices of ethnic minorities, together with their
36
37 nationalities, are more often given in articles that focus on negative issues. Such
38
39 stories include unacceptable actions of police (Chan, 2013), difficulties finding
40
41 employment even with good qualifications ('Good in Everything,' 2012), lack of
42
43 recognition as Hong Kongers by the government (Yuen & Mak, 2012), or unfair
44
45 treatment by locals ('I Have To,' 2014). These articles focus on people who could be
46
47 successful, as they have good family backgrounds and are educated, but are 'the
48
49 sacrifice under this education system' ('Good in Everything,' 2012).
50
51
52

53
54 Fifty-nine articles make a clear attempt to report in a balanced way on ethnic
55
56 minorities. *AD* does not indicate any major judgement, positive or negative, on
57
58 ethnic minorities, but emphasizes the role of the government in not addressing or
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 failing to adequately consider challenges they face. However, *AD* hardly ever
5
6 includes the voices of ethnic minorities to express how they see such problems. For
7
8 example, the Director of Unison expressed outrage with the proposal to implement
9
10 national education with a focus on China and cited disrespect for ethnic minorities
11
12 and their cultures ('Kwong Claimed,' 2012). Whether ethnic minorities see it
13
14 disrespectful to focus on China in education was not addressed. Similarly, in
15
16 discussing a program to address sexual harassment specifically targeted to ethnic
17
18 minorities, their views and evaluation of the program were not provided. Two Hong
19
20 Kong Chinese women, a director of an organization that helps women who
21
22 experience violence and a professor, commented on the issue ('Organization Claims,'
23
24 2015).

25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32 At times, articles express an aggressive position towards government
33
34 inaction and policies for ethnic minorities. Lo (2009) argues that the government
35
36 'has to grant ethnic minorities the same rights as others legally.' Lo describes Hong
37
38 Kong as a 'master and slave country,' and emphasizes that more voices should be
39
40 heard, to reveal discrimination against ethnic minorities (2009). Again, no ethnic
41
42 minorities' comments in regard to concerns raised are given, while their
43
44 experiences are used in a second-hand way to showcase wrongdoings by
45
46 authorities.
47
48
49

50
51
52 Seven articles are openly negative about ethnic minorities, and although four
53
54 articles present ethnic minorities' voices, they are used to reinforce the negativity
55
56 expressed. One article presents ethnic minorities as ignorant of local laws as they
57
58 kill cows during a holiday in violation of Hong Kong regulations ('Celebrating
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 Slaughter,' 2009). Others link them to gangsters and unsafe environments (a) and
5
6
7 oppressive culture (b):
8
9

10 (a) An article on crime in an ethnic minority area ('Cannot Work,' 2012) reports
11
12 efforts to interview people in this area who were either scared to speak, lowered
13
14 their voice, or reinforced the view that ethnic minorities abuse alcohol. The
15
16 article, whose title translates roughly as 'Using Barbarian to Control Barbarian:
17
18 Police Force Get Ethnic Minorities to be Police,' mentions the area as
19
20 'complicated' and the security situation as 'worrying.' It argues that police need
21
22 to train ethnic minorities to assist them in security and communicating with
23
24 'criminals.'
25
26
27
28

29 (b) Muslim women are represented as weak and passive. Chan expresses frustration
30
31 that 'although they study in Hong Kong, they cannot study together with boys,'
32
33 must give up their studies once married, and obey 'oppressive traditional
34
35 culture' (2013). No Muslim woman in Hong Kong represents their views on the
36
37 matter.
38
39
40
41

42 A few other references to cultural norms are provided:
43
44

45 (a) Discussing booklets for the police to understand ethnic minorities, a police
46
47 officer explains the behavior of African people in a stereotypical manner, saying
48
49 that 'Africans like talking in the streets, sometimes they will tap people, and
50
51 sometimes they will speak loudly. People may misunderstand them to be
52
53 fighting' ('New Booklets,' 2010). No 'Africans' are included to explain such
54
55 cultural patterns of behaviour.
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 (b) In 'Ethnic Minorities in Tiu King Leng,' it is claimed that 'to uphold the legacy,'
5
6 Pakistani children need to study the Quran everyday, but no explanation is given
7
8 of the Quran and its legacy.
9

10
11 (c) On two occasions Islam is portrayed in a favorable light, although only brief
12
13 explanations are given. One article details how a Pakistani boy found a wallet of
14
15 money and gave it to the police. The boy was quoted saying that Islam teaches
16
17 respect for others and their property (Lo, 2013). In 'A "Little Pakistan" in Kwai
18
19 Chung,' Lui (2013) discusses a mobile mosque that gathers Pakistani children to
20
21 pray, calling it 'a unique cultural characteristic in this public estate.' Liu explains
22
23 the meaning of praying for Muslim life and links Pakistani New Year to similar
24
25 traditions in Chinese culture.
26
27
28
29

30
31 (d) One article emphasizes how cultural knowledge can empower minorities in
32
33 difficult circumstances. Chan (2013) talks about how ethnic minority women
34
35 organized an enterprise to attain additional income using Henna. The article
36
37 makes a simplified connection to Middle Eastern and South Asian cultures by
38
39 describing Henna as a traditional artistic expression.
40
41
42
43

44 Only one article in our study explores the lack of understanding of ethnic
45
46 minorities by dominant society members. Discussing racial discrimination Tsao
47
48 (2008) states: 'in Hong Kong people discriminate against Indians, but how much do
49
50 they actually know about Indian culture?' Tsao recommends to have more experts
51
52 on India in Hong Kong and provide more resources about Indian culture in schools,
53
54 as racial discrimination stems from ignorance that 'should be corrected in education
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

not legislation' (2008). *AD* does not include the voice of Indian in Hong Kong to discuss their perspective on the need for greater cross-cultural understanding.

Discussion: alternative possibilities?

Although *AD* acts generally as a pro-multicultural news source, discussing challenges and issues on behalf of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong and representing their voices, a number of problematic themes can be observed. First, voices of ethnic minorities are limited in scope and length. Their comments are very short, and in most cases their stories are briefly represented, rather than their views on policies, practices, or incidents that involve or impact them. The voices that are represented belong to either people with a higher socioeconomic status (the Indian 'tycoon' or academics), academically successful young people fluent in Cantonese, or those who are half-Chinese. One such example is the article about the half-Pakistani professor Raees Baig (Lee, 2010a). Her story of studying at an elite school, learning Chinese, and attaining a doctorate is briefly presented, and she is quoted regarding serving as an MC at an event, that 'she could do better.' Six short sentences are devoted to her, with no larger discussion of ethnic minority issues. Meanwhile, the article quotes Fermi Wong, a Chinese Hong Konger advocate for ethnic minorities, with two paragraphs (11 sentences) discussing her opinion on the government's actions to help ethnic minorities. While Baig is complimented on her abilities as an MC and her education is discussed, Wong's position on the government and the Education Bureau are extensively provided, such as that the Deputy Commissioner Chan's 'words [about ethnic minorities] were...insulting' (Lee, 2010a).

1
2
3
4 Second, stories of ethnic minorities are used to showcase how inadequate the
5
6 government response often is, in the newspaper's view, to challenges ethnic
7
8 minorities face in Hong Kong. At the same time, they are not included in the
9
10 discussion of actions of the government or nongovernmental organizations that
11
12 directly affect them. Third, ethnic minorities' cultures are represented in a
13
14 stereotypical, surface way that does not allow the reader to understand and relate to
15
16 them. Fourth, there are still articles that give a negative representation of ethnic
17
18 minorities without including their voice to express their views or understanding of
19
20 the issue. Fifth, there is still a focus on representing certain groups as victims of
21
22 oppressive cultural practices that prevent them from progressing (the case of
23
24 Muslim women). Finally, voices of ethnic minorities are showcased primarily as a
25
26 tool of journalists (Hong Kong Chinese people) in relation to Hong Kong authorities.
27
28
29
30
31
32

33
34 In this context, private, profit-driven media may not be able to contribute to
35
36 equity, given its focus on the views and interests of the dominant group and their
37
38 perspective. In contrast, self-authored media can be a more democratic, critical, and
39
40 multicultural space for minorities to represent their views and interests on their
41
42 own terms. A study of the 2014 Umbrella Movement in Hong Kong by Walsh (2016)
43
44 shows how ethnic minority youth, by getting involved in protests and using social
45
46 media to share their own role in struggles for democracy and freedom, facilitated
47
48 broader discussions on inclusion and diversity in Hong Kong. Walsh discusses how
49
50 participation in and publication regarding social struggles changed ethnic minority
51
52 protestors' vision and understanding of their society and the world. This experience
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 gave them a sense of strength and social acceptance, and enhanced their belief that
5
6 social change is possible.
7

8
9 Walsh focuses particularly on Hong Kong Pakistani Ansah, who was part of a
10
11 group of ethnic minority youth who participated in protests. Ansah and her friends
12
13 shared videos taken by cellphones on Facebook and other social media. Though of
14
15 poor quality, the videos started discussions about diversity online. Ansah shares her
16
17 experience participating in the movement:
18
19

20
21 We knew it was a bit risky, because for us, the police can pick us up very easily. We
22
23 are very easy targets, as ethnic minorities. All the Chinese out there, and only a few
24
25 faces of us...But we had to take the risk, because we have to show we are also part of
26
27 this community, and we support them as well. We want changes in Hong Kong, for
28
29 our own future, for our families and for our upcoming generations, so we came out.
30
31

32
33 (Walsh, 2016)
34

35 However, after she started marching with her banner she found other protestors
36
37 commenting, 'We love you! You are also Hong Kong people.' As she expresses, 'even
38
39 if nothing happens, or only a bit happens, I would say something has changed for us.'
40
41 As Walsh observes such participation in society and its online documentation
42
43 provides a powerful counter narrative to stereotyped representations that cast
44
45 ethnic minorities in society as uncommitted, victims, or non-participatory.
46
47
48
49

50 Including such self-authored alternative platforms, teachers can better
51
52 include the stories and perspectives of ethnic minorities, who pose controversial
53
54 and provocative questions to the mainstream society. As in Walsh's study (2016),
55
56 their stories more effectively invite discussions on racism, history, place,
57
58 globalization, inclusion and exclusion, citizenship, and more. Using such material in
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 the classroom, teachers can help their students think critically about how
5
6 multicultural the community is and what is needed for it to become more inclusive
7
8 and safe. They can bring discussions into the classroom on how ethnic minorities
9
10 can contribute to building an inclusive environment by getting involved in struggles
11
12 for their own rights. Such learning can challenge students to think about how such
13
14 social struggles indicate participation of citizens of a multicultural, multilingual, and
15
16 democratic society, and serve to construct new knowledge and understanding about
17
18 space and place, identities, and relationships among people of different ethnicities.
19
20 Ultimately, as Walsh's study shows, young people's engagement with voices of
21
22 people from other cultural and ethnic backgrounds can give them a stronger sense
23
24 of their experiences of justice and injustice, of right and wrong, and can direct them
25
26 to understand their own society and people in it, and work towards justice and
27
28 inclusion so that no voices are misrepresented or excluded.
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38

39 **Conclusion**

40
41 Ethnic minorities experience discrimination and prejudice in Hong Kong, and are
42
43 often found in a poorer socioeconomic position. Cultural differences can lead to
44
45 misunderstandings between dominant and minority groups and make it more
46
47 challenging for ethnic minorities to adjust and for mainstream society to understand
48
49 their experiences. To close cultural gaps, multicultural education in Hong Kong has
50
51 been on the rise. To appreciate diversity and respect other cultures and views,
52
53 Liberal Studies encourages teachers to use new digital media sources. Here we
54
55 assessed one media source considered to be pro-multicultural and pro-democratic,
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65

1
2
3
4 to see how diversity is represented. Our study shows that despite having a pro-
5
6 multicultural orientation as compared to other news sources in Hong Kong, AD
7
8 remains an insufficient learning tool for multicultural education. Its voices are
9
10 mainly of the dominant group who represent ethnic minorities in a stereotypical,
11
12 victimized fashion, and act on behalf of them. We conclude that more alternative,
13
14 self-authored digital media should be used to help students in Hong Kong to more
15
16 effectively learn about and relate to each other in society in multicultural education.
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65

References

500 尼泊爾人巡遊望政府關注少數族裔教育[500 Nepali Joined the Parade and Hoped the Government Would Pay Attention to Ethnic Minorities' Education]. (2008, December 26). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

1,200 少數族裔上街爭平等 [1,200 Ethnic Minorities Fight for Equality]. (2006, December 18). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Appiah, K. A. (1994). Identity, authenticity, survival: Multicultural societies and social reproduction. In A. Gutmann (Ed.), *Multiculturalism: Examining the politics of recognition* (pp. 107-148). Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Arat, G., Hoang, A. P., Jordan, L. P., & Wong, P. W. C. (2016). A Systematic Review of Studies on Ethnic Minority Youth Development in Hong Kong: An Application of the Ecological Framework. *China Journal of Social Work*, 9(3). doi: 10.1080/17525098.2017.1254716.

Baig, R. B., & O'Connor, P. (2015). Hong Kong Muslim Representations in Cantonese Media: An Oriental Orientalism? *Asian Anthropology*, 14(1), 67-78. doi:10.1080/1683478X.2015.1025590

爽爆：無力上游 隨波入濁流 南亞裔古惑仔染黑南邊圍 [Cannot Work and Follow Suit: South Asians Gangsters in Nam Bin Wai]. (2012, October 15). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

歡度宰牲節 未領許可證 屠牛分肉回教徒被帶走 [Celebrating Slaughter Festival: The Beef Cutting Muslim Was Taken Away]. (2009, November 29). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Census and Statistics Department. (2012). *Thematic Report: Ethnic Minorities*. Hong Kong, SAR.

Chan, K. Y. (2013, December 9). 少數族裔開班教傳統藝術巴婦刺繡大獲好評 [Ethnic Minorities Open Classes for Traditional Arts: Pakistani Lady Praised]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Chee, W.-c. (2015). The Perceived Role of Religion in the Educational Attainment of Pakistani Immigrant Secondary Students in Hong Kong. *Asian Anthropology*, 14(1), 33-42. doi:10.1080/1683478X.2015.1025592

Curriculum Development Council. (2007/2014). *Liberal studies curriculum guidelines*. Hong Kong: Education Bureau.

Equal Opportunity Commission (EOC). (2011). *Education for all: Report on the Working Group on Education for Ethnic Minorities*. Hong Kong, SAR.

她眼中少數族裔故事 [Ethnic Minorities in Her Eyes]. (2013, December 9). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

少數族裔攝影展 推廣共融 [Ethnic Minorities Photography Show to Promote Inclusion]. (2014, January 20). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

【今日投票】少數族裔唱《問誰未發聲》 [Ethnic Minorities Sing ‘Do You Hear the People Sing’]. (2014, June 20). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

少數族裔投票：要憑良心做事 [Ethnic Minorities Vote: Based on Our Minds]. (2014, June 29). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Feinberg, W. (1998). *Common schools/uncommon identities: National unity and cultural difference*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Flowerdrew, J., Li, D. C. S., & Tran, S. (2002). Discriminatory News Discourse: Some Hong Kong Data. *Discourse & Society*, 13(3), 319–345.

樣樣頂呱呱 弊在中文差法律女精英在港求職碰壁 [Good in Everything but Not Chinese Legal Professional Has Difficulties Finding Jobs]. (2012, May 6). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Hamlett, T. (2016, October 2). Protesting Too Much? What the Public Will See in CY’s Legal Threat against Apple Daily. *Hong Kong Free Press*. Retrieved from <https://www.hongkongfp.com/2016/10/02/protesting-too-much-the-public-will-see-through-cys-6-page-legal-threat-against-apple-daily/>

1
2
3
4 Hammer, Y. (2007). Multiculturalism and the Mass Media. *Journal of Law and Ethics of*
5 *Human Rights*, 1(169), 1-35.

6
7
8 助少數族裔改善家居 [Help Ethnic Minorities Clean Their Homes]. (2010, March 28).
9 *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

10
11 Hong Kong Yearbook. (2015). *The Facts*. Retrieved from
12 <http://www.yearbook.gov.hk/2015/en/pdf/Facts.pdf>

13
14
15 今日我發 SING ! 菲牧師：少數族裔無處發聲 [I Have to Voice out! Filipino Priest:
16 Ethnic Minorities Have No Way to Voice out]. (2014, June 21). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved
17 from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

18
19
20 印裔富商心繫香港 回歸 10 年百人誌 夏利萊：普選應由市民決定 [Indian Tycoon's
21 Heart With Hong Kong People a Decade of Handover, Harilela: Universal Suffrage
22 Should be Decided by Citizens]. (2007, June 20). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from
23 <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

24
25
26 Jackson, L. (2014). Muslims and Islam in US Education: Reconsidering Multiculturalism.
27 London: Routledge.

28
29 Jackson, L. (2015). Religion in Hong Kong Education: Representation in Liberal Studies
30 Textbooks. *Asian Anthropology*, 14(1), 43-56.

31
32
33 Jackson, L. (2017). Learning about Diversity in Hong Kong: Multiculturalism in Liberal
34 Studies Textbooks. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 26(1), 21-29. (This
35 is listed as 2016 in the text).

36
37
38 Kapai, P. (2015). *The status of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong, 1997 to 2014*. Hong
39 Kong: Centre for Comparative and Public Law.

40
41 Kapai, P. (2015). *The status of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong, 1997 to 2014*. Hong
42 Kong: Centre for Comparative and Public Law.

43
44
45 Lai, T. W. & Siu, P. L. (2015, January 25). 泰菜館助少數族裔就業 融入香港 幫襯
46 社企 良心消費 [Thai Cuisine Helps Ethnic Minorities Join Hong Kong Society,
47 Support Social Enterprise]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

48
49
50 林煥光稱國教沒種族歧視 [Lam Woon Kwong Claimed National Education Does Not
51 Involve Discrimination]. (2012, September 14). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from
52 <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

53
54
55 Lee, P. F. (2010, November 10). 隔牆有耳：林 D9 探少數族裔考廣東話 [Side Story:
56 Lam Tests Ethnic Minorities During Visit]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from
57 <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

1
2
3
4 Lee, P. F. (2010, December 20). 隔牆有耳：《城市論壇》中巴女主持迷倒網民
5 [Outside Story: MC of 'City Forum' Charms Netizens]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from
6 <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
7
8

9 Lo, F. (2009, April 29). 蘋論：種族問題不能再掉以輕心 [Ethnic Problems Cannot Be
10 Ignored]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
11
12

13 Lo, K. Y. (2013, June 29). 【埋身擊】南亞仔執三萬元交阿 Sir 失主感動 稱對少數
14 族裔改觀 [(Touching) South Asian Boy Gave 30,000 HKD Back to Police Feeling
15 Touched and Perception Ethnic Minorities Changed]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from
16 <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
17
18

19 Loper, K. (2004). *Race and equality: A study of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong's*
20 *education system* (Occasional Paper No. 12). Hong Kong: Centre for Comparative and
21 Public Law.
22
23

24 Lui, L. S. (2013, October 27). 蘋果側影：葵涌有個「小巴基斯坦」 [A 'Little
25 Pakistan' in Kwai Chung]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
26
27

28 尼裔青年欲投考警隊化解歧視 [Nepalese Youth Aspire to Join the Police Force to
29 Solve Discrimination]. (2009, April 6). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from
30 <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
31
32

33 油尖警區出書仔教前線人員應對新措施避免少數族裔誤會 [New Booklets Out for
34 Frontline Police to Avoid Misunderstanding Ethnic Minorities]. (2010, February 22).
35 *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
36
37

38 組織指性侵求助外傭少數族裔 [Organization Claims 10% of Sexual Harassment Faced
39 By Ethnic Minorities]. (2015, March 7). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from
40 <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
41
42

43 理大生不罷學 研習尼泊爾話 [Poly U Students Ignore Boycott and Learn Nepalese].
44 (2014, September 23). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
45
46

47 School Education Statistics Section. (2012). *Statistics on the non-Chinese Speaking*
48 *Students (NCS) Population between 2006–2011*. Hong Kong: Education Bureau.
49
50

51 Tsao, C. (2008, July 20). 星期天休息：反種族歧視條例是自埋的另一顆地雷 [Rest on
52 Sunday: Anti-Racial Discrimination Bill Is Self-Made Bomb]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved
53 from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
54
55

56 Unison Hong Kong. (2012). *Racial acceptance survey report*. Hong Kong: Unison.
57
58

59 融樂會赴聯合國申訴港不公 [Unison Went to UN for Injustice in Hong Kong]. (2013,
60 March 9). *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>
61
62
63
64
65

Walsh, S. (2016). Under the umbrella: Pedagogy, knowledge production and video from the margins of the movement. *Educational Philosophy and Theory* (in press).

Wong, S. K. (2013, November 11). 文化導賞團走入少數族裔社區 香港遊世界體現共融 [Cultural Tours Enter Ethnic Minorities Community]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Wong, H. Y. & Ho W. L. (2011, May 5). 近月元朗行咁處理少數族裔案件 回歸 14 年再見巴警出更 [Patrolling in Hong Kong to Tackle Ethnic Minorities Cases: Pakistani Police Appear After 14 Years]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Yuen, L. T. (2014, March 20). 馬會獎學金首頒少數族裔 [First Ethnic Minority Awarded Jockey Club Scholarship]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Yuen, L. T. & Mak C. W. (2012, December 13). 植根港百年 巴漢被拒入籍 入境處原因：沒有近親是中國人 [Pakistani Rejected For Chinese Immigration, Department Reason: He Has No Chinese Relatives]. *Apple Daily*. Retrieved from <http://hk.apple.nextmedia.com/>

Zhao, Z., & Postiglione, G. A. (2010). Representations of Ethnic Minorities in China's University Media. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 31(4), 1-18.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65